

KETERLIBATAN PEMANGKU KEPENTINGAN UNTUK MEMBANGUN KEMBALI PARIWISATA PASCA PANDEMI

STAKEHOLDERS ENGAGEMENT FOR REBUILDING TOURISM

IN THE POST-PANDEMIC ERA

A. Risdawati Alwi Paluseri¹, Dian Karinawati Imron², Adelia Oktarina³, Muhammad Fazri⁴,
Cita Pertiwi⁵, Febrina Elia Nababan⁶, Marthella Rivera Roidatua⁷

^{1,2,3,4,5,6} Badan Riset dan Inovasi Nasional (BRIN) Republik Indonesia, ⁷ KONEKIN, Indonesia
e-mail: * a.risdawati.ap@brin.go.id

ABSTRACT

The impact of the pandemic on the tourism sector had led to the paralyzed activities of people who depend on tourism. Bali communities with their tourism strength display how their skills that linked to tourism were challenged by the pandemic situation. Their capabilities in the service sector were not sufficient to overcome the challenges. Initiations arisen from community networks to solve the problems have been conducted through upskilling. A learning community adapts and improves the skills that need to be mastered in the new tourism era. This article aims to analyze how community networks encourage upskilling as a solution through a stakeholder engagement approach employing case studies as the analytical method. Authors conducted research of the existing issues and found patterns from examples of villages that carried out upskilling activities. Findings show that the stakeholders engagement approach starts from the stakeholders mapping and they have roles in generating partnership action strategy. In addition, such activities enhance the awareness of the significant roles of stakeholders who are directly involved in those communities actions..

Keywords: Bali communities, stakeholder engagement, tourism, upskilling.

ABSTRAK

Dampak pandemi terhadap sektor pariwisata menyebabkan lumpuhnya aktivitas masyarakat yang bergantung pada pariwisata. Masyarakat Bali dengan kekuatan pariwisata mereka menunjukkan bagaimana keterampilan mereka yang terkait dengan pariwisata ditantang oleh situasi pandemi. Kemampuan mereka di sektor jasa tidak cukup untuk mengatasi tantangan. Inisiasi yang muncul dari jaringan masyarakat untuk memecahkan masalah telah dilakukan melalui upskilling. Komunitas belajar beradaptasi dan meningkatkan keterampilan yang perlu dikuasai di era pariwisata baru. Tulisan ini bertujuan untuk menganalisis bagaimana jaringan komunitas mendorong peningkatan keterampilan sebagai solusi melalui pendekatan keterlibatan pemangku kepentingan dengan menggunakan studi kasus sebagai metode analisis. Penulis melakukan penelitian terhadap isu-isu yang ada dan menemukan pola dari contoh-contoh desa yang melakukan kegiatan peningkatan keterampilan (upskilling). Temuan menunjukkan bahwa pendekatan keterlibatan pemangku kepentingan dimulai dari pemetaan pemangku kepentingan dan mereka berperan dalam menghasilkan strategi aksi kemitraan. Selain itu, kegiatan tersebut meningkatkan kesadaran akan peran penting para pemangku kepentingan yang terlibat langsung dalam tindakan masyarakat tersebut.

Kata Kunci: Bali, komunitas, keterlibatan pemangku kepentingan, pariwisata, peningkatan keterampilan

INTRODUCTION

The pandemic situation has affected various aspects of life, including the tourism sector. Whereas tourism is the second largest foreign exchange earner in Indonesia. The occurrence of a pandemic and the enactment of large-scale

social restrictions caused a decrease in state revenue in the tourism sector by US\$20.7 billion in 2020 (kemenparekraf.go.id). Based on BPS data, during 2021 the number of foreign tourist visits to Indonesia was 1.56 million, a decrease of 61.57% compared to the number of foreign

tourist visits in the same period in 2020, which amounted to 4.02 million visits. Before the pandemic, in 2019, the number of foreign tourist visits even reached 16.11 million visits. This affects foreign exchange in the tourism sector. From the World Development Indicators data (The World Bank, 2022), international tourism receipts for Indonesia amounted to US\$3.5 billion in 2020, an 80.8% decrease compared to revenues in 2019, which reached US\$18.4 billion.

Bali is the largest foreign exchange earner in Indonesian tourism. As one of the leading tourist destinations in Indonesia, the COVID-19 pandemic has resulted in the cessation of economic activities related to tourism in Bali. In 2020, Bali's economy experienced negative growth of 9.33%. The contraction will continue in 2021, but not as deep as recorded in the previous year, which only contracted as deep as 2.47% (BPS, 2022). During the pandemic, there were various restrictions in the order of people's lives. The restrictions that have the most impact on the Balinese economy come mainly from restrictions on transportation activities. These restrictions have an impact on the low number of foreign tourists visiting Bali. During 2020 the number of foreign tourist visits reached 1.06 million visits, a decrease of 83.3% compared to the previous year. In 2021, there were only around 51 visits (BPS). Tourism in Bali also reduces the income of not only government and businesses but also local communities, which depend on the tourism value chain. The decrease in tourist arrivals has an impact on the reduction of employees in the tourism industry, so this also causes unemployment in local communities to increase (Dianasari, 2021; Marhaeni et al., 2023).

Local communities have a lot of roles in the tourism industry, such as artists and cultural activists, accommodation service providers and tour guides, souvenir entrepreneurs, culinary, homestay etc. The youth helped strengthen the tourism industry. Balinese youth are involved in service sector work and contribute socially to help their environment, either at the village level or in a wider scope (Ernawati et al., 2021; Prabawati, 2019). Local women are also involved in the tourism value chain in Bali (Widiastini et al., 2021). Women are trusted to play an important

role in supporting tourism activities, both in the cultural aspect and in culinary and environmental development (Shantika et al., 2021). With their role, their knowledge and skills are formed in service fields.

The COVID-19 pandemic has had an impact on the daily lives of local people whose lives depend on tourism: lower incomes, job losses, and limited cultural activities (Gössling et al., 2021; Purwahita et al., 2021). In addition to economic issues, the capability of local communities as tourism actors is also questioned. The knowledge and skills they have so far need to be improved in order to be able to face the challenges of the pandemic.

The pandemic forces people to adapt their interaction patterns to reduce the transmission of the virus. Crowding activities are avoided so that they also have an impact on various community activities in the tourism sector. This reduction in population mobility also has an impact on the performance of tourism actors (Arini et al., 2020). Tourist destinations need to adapt to the 'new normal' policies that the government has made in the face of the pandemic. One of them is by focusing on the development of local tourism so that the tourism sector can continue to run and the economy can be rebuilt (Kadarisman, 2021).

The Minister of Tourism and Creative Economy said that there were three strategies implemented to accelerate the recovery of tourism. First, adaptation by increasing Cleanliness, Health, Safety, and Environment (CHSE) as well as health protocols to prevent COVID-19 transmission. Second, innovation in terms of infrastructure, culture, culinary, fashion, and all things related to the creative economy. Third, collaboration with various parties to open up job opportunities and increase people's purchasing power (Anggarini, 2021). Collaboration has become a key activity to encourage sustainable tourism development. Sustainable tourism development involves the interests of different people, groups, or organizations and requires the cooperation of various stakeholders. Stakeholders, based on Freeman's view (1984) are any person and/or group that can influence each other in a decision or business, either directly or indirectly

(Köpsel et al., 2021). Stakeholder involvement in tourism development can foster connection, trust, confidence, and support (Iazzi et al., 2020). Freeman argues that stakeholder engagement is not a narrow understanding that only exists in the economic aspect but also has a broader meaning in terms of the social aspect (Valentinov, 2022). The presence of stakeholder engagement encourages actors to make positive contributions to the community.

The economic recovery that is pursued through the synergy of tourism and the creative economy can take place through the empowerment of local communities. Empowerment is an action aimed at increasing the autonomy and self-determination of people and communities through the ability to represent interests, develop resources, make choices, manage assets, and gain aspirations (Bukowski & Kreissl, 2021).

Recognizing that the community's capacity in the service sector is not sufficient to overcome the challenges of the pandemic, the initiators of the network sparked efforts to redefine sustainable Bali tourism. Initial assessments were carried out, and various discussions with stakeholders at the local level were also carried out to obtain suggestions and an appropriate choice of activities for overcoming the challenges facing Bali. This study aims to analyze the role of stakeholders in rebuilding local tourism. This research takes a case study of Banjar Creative Space (BCS) in Taman Kelod, Bali, as a unit of analysis for the expansion of community networks in generating tourism in Bali.

RESEARCH METHODS

This study uses a qualitative method with a case study approach. A case study approach is used to explore specific phenomena holistically. The case study approach looks at different cases to gain insight and lead to a unique case (Creswell & Creswell, 2018). Various cases related to efforts to increase tourism emerged during the pandemic. Various efforts to improve community-based communities can be found in the regions. The research views the initiation of the development of Banjar Creative Space as an example of a unique case. Its uniqueness derives from the

utilization of existing resources at the local level. Therefore, this research was conducted at Banjar Creative Space, Taman Kelod, Ubud Village, and Gianyar Regency.

Data was collected through face-to-face interviews and an online communication platform. An in-depth interview was conducted on April 12, 2022, with the Bali Initiative Hub (BitHub), representatives of the ICCN (Indonesia Creative Cities Network), and the manager of Banjar Creative Space, Taman Kelod. In addition, there was also a telephone interview conducted with the BitHub Project Manager on June 11, 2022. Data collection in this study was carried out using an online communication platform, namely Zoom. Researchers view Zoom as feasible for data collection. In addition, the recording feature can help keep data safe and can be studied repeatedly.

This feature supports the research process, where data protection is highly provided. The other feature is security, which accommodates user authentication, real-time encryption, and backup recordings for online remote networks through 'the cloud' (Archibald et al., 2019). The first meeting via Zoom was held on May 09, 2022, and was attended by the CEO and COO of BitHub. The second meeting via Zoom was held on May 31, 2022, and was attended by five BCS Taman Kelod administrators and one supervisor. The third meeting via Zoom was held on June 13, 2022 with The Local enablers, who started the assessment research on Balinese society and tourism. ICCN representatives were also present as informants in the discussion process. All interviews were recorded with the participant's verbal consent. All interview transcripts were analyzed with data reduction. The first researcher analyzed open-ended responses, then brainstormed with a second researcher to cross-compare interpretations.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The condition of tourism in Bali during the pandemic was quite alarming. The decline in tourist numbers has an impact on the tourism sector and the value chains connected to it. Various lodging accommodations, both managed by entrepreneurs and the community, did not find

any guests visiting. Shops on the tourist-favorite pedestrian area are generally closed, and there is no visible buying and selling activity. Restaurants and food stalls are also similar. Sometimes, in the center of popular tourist destinations in Bali, there are no visitors. Local business people feel the impact of the pandemic not only on economic conditions but also on their daily activities because most people are connected to the value chain of tourism activities. People in Banjar Taman Kelod, for example, feel that there is a decrease in their daily activities, and some even feel they have become unproductive.

The situation of the local community of tourism actors describes the initial situation that encourages the motivation of an activity initiation. With these conditions, it can be observed how the community responds to changes and takes lessons from the situation. Like what happened in Bali. The tourism sector contributes 54% to Bali's GDP. The occurrence of the Pandemic caused the Bali economy to experience the deepest contraction and recover the slowest compared to other provinces in Indonesia (Bappenas, 2021). The dominance of the tourism sector caused economic activity to weaken during the pandemic, and it was difficult to recover due to Bali's less resilient economic structure (only relying on the tourism sector), thus requiring intervention not only by the government but also from various parties.

One of the concerns or interventions to improve Bali's condition so that it doesn't get worse comes from The Local Enablers (TLE) and Indonesia Creative Cities Network (ICCN) communities. TLE is a creative entrepreneurial community that carries local values to contribute positively to the environment through value-added products (www.thelocalenablers.id). ICCN is a network node for creative cities and districts based on a commitment to realize the 10 Principles of Creative Cities (iccn.or.id). The ICCN network consists of various elements of society that bring the Creative Economy Pentahelix to life, namely academics, entrepreneurs and MSMEs, communities, government, media, and aggregators.

Utilizing the ICCN network in Bali, TLE and ICCN carried out initial assessments to

capture and map solutions for Bali's economic recovery through workshops with the theme of redefining the future of the Bali movement. In its implementation, TLE and ICCN also collaborate with the Deputy for Entrepreneurship of the Ministry of Cooperatives and Small and Medium Enterprises (Kemenkop UKM). Based on the results of interviews with TLE and ICCN, this workshop was attended by various stakeholders in Bali, ranging from representatives of the DPRD in Bali, Kemenkop UKM, Smesco, academics from STMIK Primakara, the Indonesian Teachers Association of Bali Region, several media outlets in Bali, various communities, business people, and others. This workshop resulted in recommendations for strengthening economic potential in line with Bali's strengths, namely the creative economy. The creative economy is an economic component that allows for other potentials, such as tourism.

The development of this creative economy requires utilizing existing resources in Bali, namely Banjar. On average, banjars in Bali already have banjar hall facilities as a community gathering place for religious, customary, socio-cultural, and economic activities. It's just that not all banjars are able to relate to the patterns of economic development that are developing, so the economic side of the banjar tends to be inactive.

To maximize the role and facilities in the banjar, the Banjar Creative Space (BCS) was born. This initiative was encouraged and followed up through the establishment of the Bali Initiatives Hub (BitHub). BitHub is as a cross-community institution or association with the vision of potentially redefining the future of Bali. Positioning BitHub as a pioneer in the transformation process of how to utilize as much of Bali's potential as possible to simultaneously redefine Bali's future. The principle to be implemented is that the ecosystem from aspects of the source of the economy apart from tourism must also be developed as an independent ecosystem so that when one of them is disturbed, the others can still survive and cross-subsidize the sustainability of economic activities in Bali. Activation is carried out through training in the form of a series of workshops.

The process of forming Banjar Creative Space (BCS) is a program supported and inaugurated by the Minister of SOEs. In the initial stage of program execution, there are 10 (ten) Banjar Creative Spaces that will be activated. One of them is BCS Taman Kelod in Ubud Village, Gianyar Regency. With the situation of decreasing people's income in the tourism sector, BCS is an activity that seeks to increase the ability of tourism promotion with digital media. At the beginning of the BCS assessment, facilities and infrastructure were identified in Taman Kelod, such as accommodation, motorbike rental, and food stalls.

Initially, in this banjar, an association called Taman Heritage was formed to attract domestic tourism. At a time when tourism was closed in Bali due to the pandemic, people understood and reflected on the fact that their ability and capacity to manage tourism during the pandemic period were not optimal. The Heritage Park Association then stopped its activities due to the pandemic situation. During the pandemic, the increase in the use of information technology was very rapid. The tourism community is aware of its weaknesses in utilizing tourism technology and marketing through social media. Heritage Park is a historical landmark in Ubud because of the proximity of the Taman Kelod community to the temple in Ubud. However, because the Heritage Park was not developing, with the existence of BCS, the name was changed to Ubud Experience (Ubex). Ubex began to be active in March 2022.

BCS is a space that can be used as a community gathering space to initiate activities. BCS is a space, either a temple or another space in the village, that is used to support community activities. Apart from infrastructure, there is also training support for BCS managers and the community. One of the materials in the training is about digital marketing. One of the goals is for the community of Taman Kelod to be able to promote their tourism independently. The benefit of BCS is to maximize the devices owned by the management for digital marketing of Taman Kelod tourism. The Taman Kelod BCS team consists of 18 young people who come from

one area with their respective expertise such as program design, graphic design, website developers, photographers, and digital marketing. The team did a mapping in their environment to get an understanding of and project the development of activities that are in accordance with the needs of the community. Banjar Taman Kelod consists of 162 families with a population of 785 people. The area is about 5.2 hectares, so it is quite densely populated. Of the 162 families, there are 38 homestays with a total of 420 rooms. There are also 5 food stalls, 1 spa, and 2 laundries. Natural resources in the Banjar area were also reorganized. With the potential results of the mapping, BCS hopes to manage the tourism potential. One of the missions to achieve is that when Ubex runs, 10% of its income will go to the village.

The management of assistance for the BCS program is utilized in the infrastructure sector in the form of facilities and infrastructure and training activities to improve community skills, both creative product management skills and important skills such as digital marketing and the use of social media. BCS Taman Kelod focuses on development in the service sector. Therefore, tourism marketing skills are the choice of youth at BCS. Some of the training that was undertaken included website creation, video, and photography.

The stakeholder engagement process is carried out in stages. At the top central level, there is the Indonesia Creative Cities Network (ICCN) organization, which coordinates with the parties, namely the local government, in this case the Regency Government, Pertamina, and universities. At the regional level, there is the involvement of intermediaries, namely the Bali Initiative Hub (BitHub) and local universities, who become day-to-day companions in the implementation of activities. At the local level, the Banjar creative space leader becomes the leader in communication and coordination at the central level. To maintain stakeholder involvement, each party builds an environment of mutual trust, clear division of tasks, and a training vision to develop Banjar. The roles of stakeholders can be seen in the following table:

Table 1. The Roles of Stakeholder

Stakeholder	Roles
Social Enterprise (The Local Enablers)	Initial assessment of activities and encouraging the emergence of the <u>Banjar Creative Space</u> idea
ICCN	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Initial modeling and activity design - Mapping actor potential - Leading Stakeholder Coordination
BUMN, <u>Pertamina</u>	Supporting activation Funding through CSR
<u>Kemenkop</u> UKM/ SMESCO	Initial mapping and product facilitation for sales
Media	Initial mapping and promotion of activities
University (STMIK PRIMAKARA)	Initial mapping, implementation, providing facilitators, and developing training curriculum
Trainer	Interactive teaching of training materials, both theory and practice. In addition, the trainer also provides weekly evaluations of the implementation of activities by BCS <u>Taman Kelod</u> .

The Local Enablers (TLE) reside within the ICCN network node, so activities get support for implementation. ICCN develops a stakeholder engagement model. There are several models developed by ICCN, namely hexahelics. This model seeks to answer how the application of cross-city stakeholder involvement and research collaboration. Based on helical mapping, it is determined who is the most dominant actor to realize the activity and become the driving factor for success. Next, map the local government. The community in Bali then invited the provinces, governors, and mayors to get involved at the central level, and ICCN attracted the attention of the central government, namely the Ministry of SOEs. Through Pertamina, funding support for activities is provided. Pertamina was also involved from the initial stage, namely the kick-off meeting, supporting ecosystem activation, and providing network expansion to support activities.

The role of TLE as an agility/start-up institution in Jatinangor is to build cooperation with community networks in Bali to address the issue of Bali's declining economy. Then, the lesson learned is that Bali's future economy cannot depend solely on tourism. Therefore, research results revealed that it was impossible to

continue with tourism alone; it had to touch other economic sectors. So far, it is only an attraction, the creative economy only supports the tourism system and encourages the creative economy. Banjar mapping was then carried out at the meeting center in Banjar, there was information, art, and culture, which finally concluded why the banjar was not activated.

Furthermore, there is a regional community that plays an important role in BCS activation, namely BitHub. BitHub, together with the Primakara School of Informatics and Computer Management (STMIK), held a training with materials according to the abilities of the trainees from BCS. Some participants studied content creation and digital marketing. There are also training participants who receive materials on waste treatment and product development. The training participants are representatives of BCS and also involve the community, such as the Family Welfare Empowerment Group. The training curriculum is made by STMIK Primakara. The training lasts for 3-4 months, with a schedule every Sunday at 18.00-22.00 WITA, consisting of 2 sessions. Each group creates a Whatsapp group with a mentor for consultation. During the training, they will be given weekly assignments and immediately evaluated at the next meeting next week. After the training, the management of

Taman Kelod BCS is also still being assisted in the selected activities to be developed.

BitHub and Primakarya are planning a workshop series: offline workshop series of 264 workshops for 4 months, divided into 3 large segments with several modules. There are foundation modules ranging from Lightning Decision Jam (LDJ), design thinking, entrepreneurship motivation, etc. (8 modules). Making the younger generation or community start moving toward positive activities and, secondly, understanding the pattern of mindset development. Product development (8 modules) requires quite a lot of acceleration by creating creative content. So that the products in the banjar can compete, the majority of marketing development courses teach marketing strategy online (8 modules). Modules are flexible in nature to adapt to community conditions. At the beginning, the syllabus is the same, with the modules that banjar generally needs.

In addition, youth are also actively involved in the BCS program. The motivation for the youth to join the Taman Kelod BCS was initiated because, during the pandemic, they still did not have a job and were unproductive, but each had expertise. Digital training made them interested, and they finally agreed to build a community together. In addition, the administrators also have a sibling relationship with each other, thus encouraging stronger community bonds. The Head of the Kelod Park Environment is the supervisor of the BCS management as well as the one who establishes communication with BitHub.

This research aims to analyze the role of stakeholders in rebuilding local tourism. The process of involving stakeholders has been carried out in the early stages of the assessment regarding the impact of Bali tourism on the community. The parties involved in the initial assessment stated that community involvement was focused on people who had a common vision to rebuild Bali. Stakeholder involvement begins with mapping out actors who are seen as having an influence in encouraging the development of Bali, including local governments, communities, universities, the media, and organizations. The method after the actor mapping is to capture community nodes that

realize the importance of adapting to change and accepting ideas to develop community creative spaces. The parties gathered, discussed the challenges of Bali's tourism development, and agreed on a common idea, namely to encourage the redefinition of Bali's future. This discussion activity sparked the awareness of each party to plan activities that could activate the community. This is in line with several studies that state that it is important to identify stakeholders and map their respective roles to achieve its goals (Gupta et al., 2020; Mitchell & Lee, 2019; Schimperna et al., 2021).

The pandemic situation faced by local communities made them aware of several things. First, tourism, which is usual, cannot last long. Second, they realize that their abilities are limited to the service sector, feel they have no other skills, and need to improve their skills. They feel the need to quickly adapt. Third, they realize the importance of the support of various parties when the situation becomes increasingly critical. They start to find out about ways that can be done to adapt. They also map out the potential support that can be reached (Iroz-Elardo et al., 2021).

BitHub injects through the Banjar Creative Space program, with the aim of: At least make the younger generation, especially, get out of bed to do productive or positive activities. Therefore, one of the fundamental and regular activations of BCS is through workshop series conducted face-to-face. The BCS Project Manager is in charge of managing the training time between the trainer and Banjar. The training syllabus is the same, but the training is tailored to the needs of Banjar. LDJ material and design thinking (Bordin, 2020; Courtney, 2018; Victorino et al., 2022) are basic materials for all Banjars.

In the process of implementing the activities, efforts were made to overcome the problems faced by BCS. For example, in training, the meeting schedule is based on mutual agreement. The challenge that is felt to be heavy is the mental block, where there is an a priori attitude from previous activities. To overcome this problem, BitHub approached potential partners who could support it financially.

This research reveals that the parties were involved in the initial process, but during the implementation process, several parties handed over the technical implementation to the intermediary team that accompanied day to day. At the monitoring stage, not all stakeholders are involved. Several portions of the division of tasks to intermediaries and the absence of standard procedures for activities show that stakeholders do not always assist at the local level. The parties involved in the initial process, from implementation to monitoring, are trainers from Primakara, Alfaprima, and partnering experts who are known as event organizers. Regarding the monitoring of training activities, there are several procedures carried out. First, making Minutes from the Trainer, which explains the contents of the assignment, checks whether there are problems or not, and if there are problems, they are resolved to Banjar. Evaluation can be carried out by direct visits or through the PIC Banjar.

The implementation of the training is also not without problems. The obstacle during the training at BCS Taman Kelod was the resources (participants) who had started working again, so there was minimal attendance at the training or changing people. Thus, the training does not run optimally. There is no letter of commitment; participants are selected by Banjar by invitation or appointment as long as they are willing. BCS Taman Kelod is not grouped into 3 categories (entrepreneur, ibupreneur, and digipreneur) like other banjars. The average number of participants per category is 10-22 people. The training is held on an individual basis. There is an interesting activity called Ibupreneur. This activity is a training in making cakes, candles, and soap from used cooking oil. This training is intended as a starter if Banjar does not yet have a product. BCS's achievement target is to be able to sell products and services by being observant, seeing the potential, and mastering digital marketing. Sales are not only around Banjar but are also known throughout Indonesia.

The current BCS is actually a prototype, it is hoped that in the future they will be able to

roll independently, both in terms of engagement with the parties they need, and then developing potential based on their strengths. Including in terms of numbers, because for 4600 banjar, Bithub will not be able to handle it alone, it is limited in resources and funding. There is a circle that has been built that can support sustainability.

The implementation of Banjar Creative Space (BCS) activities has been started since early 2022. Each BCS has followed the flow of activities, namely mapping the potential of Banjar, involvement in training, and developing BCS activities. The important thing that needs to be considered then is the extent of the role and presence of stakeholders during the process of implementing activities, monitoring and evaluating activities, and assessing the effectiveness and achievement of activity targets. Stakeholder engagement analysis can be started by mapping the level of participation of the parties who have joined the activity. Based on the IAP2 International Federation (Policy, 2018; Team, 2020), the spectrum of participation can be seen in levels. BCS is at the 'collaborate' level where every party in BCS has been involved and has become a partner in decision-making, developing alternative activities, and identifying proposed solutions for activities. However, in the process of involving BCS representatives in activities, there are several gaps that need to be considered related to aspects of governance, determination of achievements, assessment of effectiveness, success and impact, and aspects of sustainability.

Discussion on the governance of activities can be started by identifying what activities the parties have agreed to carry out. Then, analyze the extent to which the implementation of activities is in accordance with the plan. The parties agreed to support the development of human resources and infrastructure support for business facilities and infrastructure. BCS Taman Kelod is actively involved in training and chooses to develop digital marketing, one of which is through the development of websites and videos for tourism promotion. In terms of infrastructure support, until now BCS has not yet determined the forms of infrastructure support that will be carried out.

In the aspect of governance, it can be seen that the procedures for implementing BCS activities are not in the form of a formal document. The rules of the game are understood by actors at the central level who implementing activities in the regions, in this case BitHub, and the person in charge at the local level at BCS. However, there is a gap in understanding between BCS members, BCS management, and activity managers at the regional level regarding the procedures for implementing activities. For example, the question of how the activity roadmap from BCS can be developed, how the use of funding support is carried out, and the extent to which information and knowledge related to activities can be shared down to the local level, namely actors in BCS, become markers for integrated activity management.

Furthermore, the monitoring process reveals the extent to which the implementation of activities is in accordance with the planning. This study found is observed from the monitoring process carried out. This study found that there is no document for monitoring and evaluation procedures for BCS activities. Monitoring activities in general include training activities and the use of financial support. Monitoring on training activities is carried out by STIMIK Primakarya, and monitoring of the use of infrastructure support is carried out by BitHub. For the responsibility of implementing the activity, make an accountability report, fill out product photo information and notes, fill in product specifications and prices. The next process, namely the evaluation of activities, has not yet been carried out because the program is still running. The important thing to note is the evaluation of stakeholder engagement (Bahadorestani et al., 2020; Sanghera, 2019).

In the monitoring process, the opinion of BCS members about the perceived benefits and impacts of BCS activities can be studied. BCS Taman Kelod participants expressed their opinions after receiving training from BCS activities, namely: (1) gaining knowledge for digital product marketing; (2) learning to organize to jointly advance Banjar; (3) product development in the form of tourism activities

to increase tourist attraction, both domestic and international.

CONCLUSIONS

The impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on the tourism sector was felt not only from the economic decline but also from the awareness of the importance of sustainable tourism. One of the areas that relies on tourism for the survival of the community and is the most affected is Bali. The case study of Banjar Creative Space (BCS) in Taman Kelod, Bali, shows that the role of stakeholders is very important in increasing the knowledge and capability of tourism actors to restore tourism in Bali. The involvement of SOEs, social enterprises, creative communities, training institutions to experts forms an inclusive ecosystem that supports each other's efforts to develop sustainable tourism at BCS Taman Kelod. Each stakeholder carries out its role, starting from initial research, programming and curriculum development, funding activities, to implementing training. Openness, public trust, and commitment are three things that strengthen the knot of stakeholder engagement.

REFERENCES

- Anggarini, D. T. (2021). Upaya Pemulihan Industri Pariwisata dalam Situasi Pandemi Covid-19. *Jurnal Pariwisata*, 8(1), 22–31. <https://doi.org/10.31294/par.v8i1.9809>.
- Archibald, M. M., Ambagtsheer, R. C., Casey, M. G., & Lawless, M. (2019). Using Zoom Video-conferencing for Qualitative Data Collection: Perceptions and Experiences of Researchers and Participants. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 18, 1–8. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1609406919874596>.
- Arini, I. A. D., Paramita, I. B. G., & Triana, K. A. (2020). Ekspektasi, Realisasi dan Negosiasi Tourism Reborn di Masa Pandemi Dalam Pariwisata Bali. *Cultoure: Jurnal Ilmiah Pariwisata Budaya Hindu*, 1(2), 101–111. <https://doi.org/10.55115/cultoure.v1i2.825>.
- Bahadorestani, A., Naderpajouh, N., & Sadiq, R. (2020). Planning for sustainable stakeholder engagement based on the assessment of conflicting interests in projects. *Journal of*

- Cleaner Production*, 242, 118402. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2019.118402>.
- Bappenas. (2021). *Transformasi Ekonomi Bali, Peta Jalan Ekonomi Kerthi Bali Menuju Bali Era Baru: Hijau, Tangguh, Sejahtera*.
- Bordin, S. (2020). Design Sprint: fast problem-solving through collaboration. *ICSOB '22: 13th International Conference on Software Business*. <https://ceur-ws.org/Vol-3316/industry-paper3.pdf>.
- Bukowski, M., & Kreissl, K. (2021). *Empowerment, Poverty, and Vulnerability* (pp. 1–14). https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-69625-6_131-1.
- Courtney, J. (2018). *Lightning Decision Jam: A Workshop to Solve Any Problem*. <https://uxplanet.org/lightning-decision-jam-a-workshop-to-solve-any-problem-65bb42af41dc>.
- Creswell, J. W., & Creswell, J. D. (2018). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches* (5th ed.). SAGE.
- Dianasari, D. A. M. L. (2021). Dampak Pandemi Covid-19 Terhadap Ekonomi dan Lingkungan Fisik di Desa Wisata di Bali. *Jurnal Kepariwisataaan*, 20(2), 99–106. <https://doi.org/10.52352/jpar.v20i2.469>
- Ernawati, N. M., Arjana, I. W. B., & Nadra, N. M. (2021). Forest supports living on earth: awareness of the youth at Jembrana Regency Bali Province Indonesia. *International Journal of Green Tourism Research and Applications*, 3(1), 35–39. <https://doi.org/10.31940/ijogtra.v3i1.2388>.
- Gössling, S., Scott, D., & Hall, C. M. (2021). Pandemics, tourism, and global change: a rapid assessment of COVID-19. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 29(1), 1–20. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09669582.2020.1758708>.
- Gupta, K., Crilly, D., & Greckhamer, T. (2020). Stakeholder engagement strategies, national institutions, and firm performance: A configurational perspective. *Strategic Management Journal*, 41(10), 1869–1900. <https://doi.org/10.1002/smj.3204>.
- Iazzi, A., Pizzi, S., Iaia, L., & Turco, M. (2020). Communicating the stakeholder engagement process: A cross-country analysis in the tourism sector. *Corporate Social Responsibility and Environmental Management*, 27(4), 1642–1652. <https://doi.org/10.1002/csr.1913>.
- Iroz-Elardo, N., Erickson, H., Howell, A., Olson, M., & Currans, K. M. (2021). *Community Engagement in a Pandemic*. University of Arizona.
- Kadarisman, A. (2021). Government public relations dalam pengembangan pariwisata masa pandemi COVID-19 di Geopark Ciletuh. *Profesi Humas Jurnal Ilmiah Ilmu Hubungan Masyarakat*, 5(2), 270–290. <https://doi.org/10.24198/prh.v5i2.29800>.
- Köpsel, V., de Moura Kiipper, G., & Peck, M. A. (2021). Stakeholder engagement vs. social distancing—how does the Covid-19 pandemic affect participatory research in EU marine science projects? *Maritime Studies*, 20(2), 189–205. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s40152-021-00223-4>.
- Marhaeni, A. A. I. N., Yuliarmi, N. N., Sanjaya, H., Primajana, D. J., & Itarini, N. M. (2023). Length of Time to Get a Job Back During the Covid-19 Pandemic in Badung District. *International Journal of Social Science and Business*, 7(1), 34–42. <https://doi.org/10.23887/ijssb.v7i1.53136>.
- Mitchell, R. K., & Lee, J. H. (2019). Stakeholder identification and its importance in the value creating system of stakeholder work. In *The Cambridge handbook of stakeholder theory* (Vol. 1, pp. 53–73).
- Policy, P. P. (2018, June 25). *Matters that may impact them: Effective public participation is a learning opportunity*. <https://www.coaldale.ca/sites/default/files/uploads/bylaws-policies/Public-Participation-Policy-C-017-0618-1.pdf>.
- Prabawati, N. P. D. (2019). Peran Pemuda dalam Kegiatan Pengembangan Pariwisata di Desa Tibubeneng, Kabupaten Badung, Bali. *Jurnal Kepariwisataaan Indonesia: Jurnal Penelitian Dan Pengembangan Kepariwisataaan Indonesia*, 13(1), 73–84. <https://doi.org/10.47608/jki.v13i12019.73-84>.
- Purwahita, A. R. M., Wardhana, P. B. W., Ardiasa, I. K., & Winia, I. M. (2021). Dampak Covid-19 terhadap Pariwisata Bali Ditinjau dari Sektor Sosial, Ekonomi, dan Lingkungan (Sebuah Tinjauan Pustaka). *Jurnal Kajian Dan Terapan Pariwisata*, 1(2), 68–80. <https://doi.org/10.53356/diparojs.v1i2.29>.
- Sanghera, P. (2019). Monitoring Stakeholder Engagement and Communication. In *PMP® in Depth* (pp. 519–533). Apress. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-4842-3910-0_14.
- Schimperna, F., Lombardi, R., & Belyaeva, Z. (2021). Technological transformation, culinary tourism and stakeholder engagement: emerging trends from a systematic literature review. *Journal of Place Management and Development*, 14(1),

66–80. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JPMD-03-2020-0028>.

- Shantika, B., Ernawati, N. M., & Sarja, N. L. A. K. Y. (2021). Balinese Women's Role and Gender Gap in the Sustainable Tourism Development. *International Journal of Green Tourism Research and Applications*, 3(2), 49–57. <https://doi.org/10.31940/ijogtra.v3i2.49-57>.
- Team, S. L. C. C. E. (2020). *Practices for Engagement in the Time of COVID*. Guide. [https://www.iap2usa.org/resources/Documents/Final%20Best%20Practices%20for%20Engagement%20During%20COVID-19%20V2%20\(1\).pdf](https://www.iap2usa.org/resources/Documents/Final%20Best%20Practices%20for%20Engagement%20During%20COVID-19%20V2%20(1).pdf).
- The World Bank. (2022). *World Development Indicators*. DataBank. <https://databank.worldbank.org/source/world-development-indicators#>.
- Valentinov, V. (2022). Stakeholder Theory: Toward a Classical Institutional Economics Perspective. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 1–14. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10551-022-05304-w>.
- Victorino, G., Bandeira, R., Painho, M., Henriques, R., & Coelho, P. S. (2022). Rethinking the Campus Experience in a Post-COVID World: A Multi-Stakeholder Design Thinking Experiment. *Sustainability*, 14(13), 7655. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su14137655>.
- Widiastini, N. M. A., Rosa, S. A. S., Putera, R. E., Susilowati, G., & Wibowo, T. H. (2021). The resilience of women tourism workers during the COVID-19 pandemic in Bali. *Sosiohumaniora*, 23(3), 372–379. <https://doi.org/10.24198/sosiohumaniora.v23i3.31556>.